

Lower Eyre Peninsula
MARINE PARK LOCAL ADVISORY GROUP

MINUTES

The fourth meeting of the Lower Eyre Peninsula Marine Park Local Advisory Group (MPLAG) was held at 1pm, on the 16th February, 2011, in the Ravendale Community Sports Centre, Port Lincoln.

We acknowledge and respect the traditional custodians whose lands we are meeting upon today. We acknowledge the deep feelings of attachment and relationship of Aboriginal peoples to country. We also pay respect to the cultural authority of Aboriginal people visiting/attending from other areas of South Australia/Australia present here.

Members Present: Danny Bartlett (Chair), Bill Ford, Kerryn McEwan, Norm Clifford Pope, Philip Porter, Brian Saunders, Steve Moriarty, David Sherry, Albert Thomas Whittle and Brenton Growden.

Supporting Staff: Dirk Holman, Shelley Harrison, Jon Emmet and Louise Smith.

Gallery: 25 people were present in the gallery

1. Welcome

Danny Bartlett (Chair) welcomed MPLAG and gallery members to the 4th Local Advisory Group meeting.

2. Apologies

Carol Gale, Bill Stenson and Andrew Wright.

3. Other business

- The Chair briefly outlined discussion points and issues raised at the Chairs' Meeting with the Minister for Environment and Conservation on Thursday 10 February 2011. The outcome of the meeting had been e-mailed to the Chairs of the MPLAGs.

Action: The response from this meeting from Minister Caica has been e-mailed to all the MPLAG members.

- It was noted that there is still no representative from the Lincoln Marine Science Centre to sit in the Lower Eyre Peninsula MPLAG.

Action: DENR will continue to work towards getting a representative from the Lincoln Marine Science Centre.

4. Minutes from previous meeting

Minutes of the meeting held on 17 November 2010 were accepted by the membership with no amendments to the minutes.

Actions from Previous Meeting

Meeting No.	Responsibility	Action	Status	Date
3	DENR	Minutes of the meeting to be put up on the web.	To be implemented once ratified in meeting 4	After MPLAG meeting 4.
3	DENR	Replacement for Dirk Holman with a representative from the Lincoln Marine Science Centre.	To be implemented.	<i>In progress</i>
3	Chair (MPLAG)	Letter to the Marine Park Council of South Australia on the issue of funding for compliance work and research.	To be implemented.	
3	DENR	The record of the meeting will be e-mailed and discussed in the next meeting.	Placed on Marine Parks website	Immediately after each MPLAG meeting.

5. Correspondence:

The letters addressed to the Chair were tabled for member's information and are presented below:

- Brenton Gear, acting Executive Director Policy, DENR dated 14 January, 2011;
- A letter containing questions from Damien Smart for the recreational fishermen;
- Danny Bartlett's response to Damien Smart's letter;
- Minister Paul Caica's letter to the Displaced Effort Working Group;
- Shane Mensforth (e-mail) on issues around Rocky Island and Kellidie Bay areas – recreational fisherman and charter fishing's view;
- Michael Roberts on concerns around Marine Park no. 5 (Thorny Passage Marine Park) and the sanctuary zones;
- JC & C Fuss on the sanctuary zones and the on going marine park process;
- Peter Allan (marine scale fisherman) on sanctuary zones and the marine parks process;
- C.K. Bald on line fishing and the impact on the proposed sanctuary zones;
- A letter from Jennifer Taylor of the Rodney Fox Foundation (e-mail) suggesting the setting up of a sanctuary zone encompassing the entire Neptune Islands;
- Danny (chair) letter to Minister Paul Caica from MPLAG meeting 3 on the Displaced Effort Working Group and Compensation issue;
- Letter from Brian Saunders to Simon Clark with alternative zoning advice;
- Letter from Brian Saunders outlining his concern regarding public interference from the gallery at MPLAG 3;
- A press release from the Convention on Biological Diversity regarding the recent Nagoya Biodiversity Summit;
- Danny Bartlett's Chairperson's report;
- A letter from Robert Kearney responding to recent letters from Allan Holmes;
- Allan Holmes' letter to the editor for Sunday January 23, 2011;
- A letter from Tony Burke to Gary Morgan;
- Two letters from Robert Pike concerning his fishing interests at Coffin Bay;

- The ANZECC paper titled *Guidelines for establishing the national representative system of marine protected areas (1998)*;
- The Ernst & Young paper entitled *Australia's marine protected areas: Challenging times ahead (2006)*.

Danny (Chair) made available all letters and correspondences from December and matters relating to the marine parks to all members of the MPLAG.

6. Share community feedback on preliminary sanctuary zones scenarios

LAG Members	Views/feedback from the LAG members representative groups
Danny Bartlett	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Port Lincoln City Council is concerned with the size and extent of initial DENR zoning scenario, particularly in relation to the economic impact on commercial fishing. • Council is in the process of developing a formal position on marine parks.
Bill Ford	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • All his community feedback was negative, with all stating the parks are too big and too many in numbers. • He indicated the abalone industry advice would come at the stakeholder consultation stage. • Asked what happened at the Ceduna meeting.
Steve Moriarty	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cynical response from all members on the whole process. • Industry are ready to co-manage the environment and draw lines on maps once the pool of money available for compensation is known. • Questioned the need for sanctuary zones when there are already well managed fisheries. • The information for MPLAG members is received too late. • He considered there are too many unanswered questions e.g. bag limit reduction after the marine parks comes in? • Questioned the disconnect between the marine parks process, PIRSA and the fishing industry • Asserts that the process should be threats based, and the Working Group process should have been retained.
Philip Porter	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • E-mails from the Australian Scuba Divers Federation and the Marine Life Society of SA - have been fairly happy with the marine park scenario. They are particularly concerned about Thorny Passage. • The Lower Eyre Peninsula District Council is concerned about the effects of sanctuary zones on line fishing at Coffin Bay.
Brenton Growden	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Block owners at Wedge Island are concerned about the marine park as it would significantly affect the fishing activities of the Island's residents.
Brian Sounders	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Most people are happy with the marine parks. • The conservation group, Birds Australia are

	<p>unhappy about the exclusion of shore bird protection in the Coffin Bay area.</p>
Kerryn McEwan	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • There are concerns about the locations of the two desalination plants. The Minister should put pressure on SA Water to identify the locations and not have the plant sandwiched between the marine parks. • The sanctuary zones should be only established after the locations of the desalination plants have been made known. • Asserted that marine parks are based on a precautionary process rather than responding to threats – comparing it to establishing national parks on land in healthy areas. • Highlighted the need to protect areas to ensure resilient marine communities are able to adapt to the effects of climate change. • Alluded to the fact that the 10% figure was a suggestion by the Scientific Working Group and Marine Parks Council of which there is commercial fishing representation.
Albert Whittle	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Many people from Ceduna, Port Augusta and Whyalla agree that some of the areas in the marine parks should be turned into multiple use. • Suggested that Marine Parks need to set aside areas of value rather than volume. • Questioned the concept of spill over. • Recognised the value of sanctuary zones as control areas as performance indicators. • Also indicated that his peers had reported widespread elevated sea temperatures.
Norm Pope	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The recreational fishermen are concerned with the size of the marine park as many of the areas are favourite fishing spots. • The issue of the desalination plants and boundary markers was raised. • Many recreational fishermen believe that there is a need to protect fish breeding and congregation areas (prior to breeding) and nursery beds. • Indicated recreational fishers are largely willing to work with the process and have started putting lines on maps.
David Sherry	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The zones are many and too big in size • Marine scale fishers have already had quota buy-out.

Dirk Holman (DENR) made a presentation on the Marine Park Management Planning Process

MPLAG Executive Officer, Dirk Holman, Department of Environment and Natural Resources (DENR) gave a short presentation which included:

- Thanking the MPLAG members, who are all volunteers for their time and effort;
- The way forward post MPLAG meeting 4;
- Brief review and reminder about using the sanctuary zone checklist when considering alterations to the preliminary sanctuary zones;
- A spatial presentation showing the suggested zoning alterations that community and MPLAG members have provided since MPLAG meeting 3.

Dr. Shelley Harrison (DENR) presented on the Gambier and Neptune Islands

7. MPLAG Members Workshop

MPLAG members provided advice on the preliminary zoning scenarios which are outlined in the table below.:

Zone	Comment number (or colour)	Comment
A	A1 (yellow)	Remove north section of sanctuary zone to allow recreational kingfish (possibility for catch and release).
	A2 (red)	Incorporate intertidal and shallow subtidal area north and extend south eastern boundary.
B	B1 (orange)	500m shoreline buffer for recreational fishing in front of camps.
	B2 (blue)	Move boundary at mouth west to accommodate commercial and recreational fishing.
C	C1 (red)	Remove completely
	C2 (yellow)	Ledge, saltmarsh and seagrass within this zone – move south to avoid White Lady.
	C3	Reduce size
	C4	Alternative to original
	C5	Alternative to original (expansion)
D	D1 (yellow)	No issues – ease of identification?
Tadpole Bay	Tadpole Bay (pink)	Tadpole Bay is a possible trade off for east Kellidie Bay (Zone A) (contingency).
E	E1 (red)	Supported as important samphire, seagrass and sponges – include north boundary of park and straighten southern zone.
Longnose	1 (yellow)	Birds Australia recommends sanctuary zone on the southern shoreline of Point Longnose as important for migratory waders.
	2 (yellow)	Marine scale and cockles oppose.
F	F1 (yellow)	Remove completely – high level of concern from all fishing sectors.
	F2 (yellow)	Request for alternative – unresolved. Possible trade off with Dutton Bay.
G	G1 (red)	Remove completely
	G2 (red)	Look to replicate/represent habitat.

H	H1 (blue)	Not supported as is from commercial sector.
	H2 (blue)	Look for some area or align with the Whidbey Wilderness Protection area.
I	I1 (yellow)	Zone rejected by all sectors.
	I2 (yellow)	Possibly replace with habitat protection zone.
	I3 (yellow)	Look for replication if removed.
	I4 (yellow)	Possible seasonal closures.
	I5 (red)	Recreational fishing suggestion to maintain access to the east side of Rocky Island.
J	J1 (yellow)	Rejected by the commercial fishing sector.
	J2 (red)	Combine J and K – relocate desalination plant.
	J3 (pink)	Recreational fishing alternative suggestions for J and K.
	J4 (pink)	Commercial fishers reject comment J3 and alternative.
K	K1 (green)	Rejected by the commercial fishing sector.
L	L1 (yellow)	Rejected by the commercial fishing sector.
	L2 (red)	Recreational fishing suggested sanctuary zone.
M	M1 (pink)	Rejected by the commercial fishing sector.
	M2 (blue)	Avoid fragmentation – combine M & N.
	M3 (blue)	Commercial fishing sector don't support comment M2.
O	O1 (red)	Rejected by commercial fishing sector.
	O2 (blue)	Recreational fishing possible alternative sanctuary zone.
	O3 (red)	Maintain as is from ecological perspective. Invertebrate community, large fish, gulf supply.
	O4 (red)	Maintain as is from recreational diving perspective.

Note: these comments should be read in conjunction with the feedback map.

8. Communications planning

The communication plan remains the same as the previous meeting.

MPLAG member	Organisation/group
Danny Bartlett	Port Lincoln City Council
	Rate payers
Kerryn McEwan	Coastal Care Group
	Coffin Bay Progress Association
David Sherry	Commercial Scale Fishers
	Executive Officers Marine Scale Fisher Association
Norm Pope	Recreational fishers
	Commercial link up
	South Australian Recreational Fishing Advisory Council
Philip Porter	Lower Eyre Peninsula District Council
	Australian Scuba Diving Federation
	Marine Life Society
Carol Gale	Coffin Bay Tour Association
	Oyster farmers
	Lincoln Marine Science researchers

Andrew Wright	Charter fishers (Lincoln)
	Tourism Eyre Peninsula
	Other tour operators
Brenton Growden	Wedge Island Management Committee
Bill Ford	Western Zone Abalone Association
Roger Rowe	Northern Zone Rock Lobster Executive

9. Questions from the gallery

The questions raised at the gallery were:

- **Question:** Insufficient advertisement in the media (newspapers & television) for the MPLAG meetings;
- **Dirk responded:** The Lower EP MPLAG 4 meeting was definitely advertised in both the Port Lincoln Times and Eyre Tribune two weeks prior to the meeting date.
- The timing of the meetings in the afternoon makes it difficult for members of the public to attend.
- **Dirk responded:** These meetings had been set at this time since the inception of MPLAGs. Each meeting is set at the same time each round to ensure consistency.
- **Steve Moriarty added:** If the meetings were held at night and attracted too much public interest, it would be difficult for the MPLAG to achieve outcomes from the meetings.
- **Comment:** Native Title applications have to be resolved before sanctuary zoning can take place
- **Jon responded:** This is incorrect, but Native Title applicants/holders, signatories to Indigenous Land Use Agreements and other traditional owners must be consulted through this process.
- **Comment:** The representative of the Sardine Fishery, Paul Watson, quoted from the 2006 report *Evaluating the Effectiveness of Marine Protected Areas as a Fisheries Management Tool* (FRDC Project No. 1999/162) in suggesting that fisheries management utilising ESD principles can provide superior biodiversity conservation outcomes than marine protected areas.
- **Jon responded:** Acknowledged that the report makes this suggestion but it also suggests that fisheries managed to ESD standards may still have impacts which cascade through ecosystems, and sanctuary zones seek to protect against such impacts. The Maria Island example in the report also shows that sanctuary zones can achieve good conservation outcomes.

10. Record of Meeting

- Correspondence from a range of sources was tabled and members were given the opportunity to discuss any issues arising.
- It was confirmed that DENR has approached Lincoln Marine Science Centre for a replacement of MPLAG member, however to date a replacement has not been identified.
- DENR presented community feedback on preliminary sanctuary zoning scenarios.
- Each sanctuary zone was discussed by members. There was some consensus between all members for some small sanctuary zones within the Coffin Bay area. In all areas outside of Coffin Bay there was little consensus between members. In particular members who are involved in commercial fishing rejected most of the sanctuary zones outright, and did not provide any suggestions for alternatives.

- Members agreed to continue communications with the community as outlined in the communication plan previously.
- Questions and comments from the gallery were received.

Actions:

11. Next meeting.

The date of the next meeting would be advised by DENR.

Meeting Closed at 5.50 pm.

Chair Danny Bartlett

Date

Actions item summary as at 16/2/2011

Meeting No.	Responsibility	Action	Status	Date
3	DENR	Replacement for Dirk Holman with a representative from the Lincoln Marine Science Centre	To be implemented	<i>In process</i>
4	DENR	The Chair/DENR to request the location of the desalination plants from SA Water through Minister Caica before the sanctuary zones are established in this marine park.		